

Supplemental Material to “Deep Learning Moment Closure Approximations using Dynamic Boltzmann Distributions”

Oliver K. Ernst, Tom Bartol, Terrence Sejnowski, Eric Mjolsness

May 31, 2021

Contents

1	Variational problem for dynamic Boltzmann distributions in continuous space	1
1.1	Review of variational problem	1
1.2	Recover formalism for dynamic centered deep Boltzmann machines	2
2	Derivation of the centered gradient for DBMs in Section 3.3	4
3	Derivation of the moment closure approximation made by dynamic Boltzmann distributions in Section 4.2	5
4	Derivation of the centered gradient for dynamic Boltzmann distributions in Section 4.3	5
4.1	Transforming the reduced model to the centered parameters	6
4.2	Derivation of the adjoint system	6
4.3	Derivation of the sensitivity equation	8

1 Variational problem for dynamic Boltzmann distributions in continuous space

A general variational problem for the reduced model describing a reaction-diffusion systems in continuous space can be formulated as shown in [1]. Here we review the key results, and the show connection to the deep Boltzmann machine (DBM) notation used in this paper.

1.1 Review of variational problem

The state of a reaction-diffusion system at time t is described by n particles of species α at locations \mathbf{x} . Introduce k -particle interaction functions $\nu_k(\alpha_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, \mathbf{x}_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, t)$ for $k = 1, \dots, K$ (i.e. cutoff K), where $\langle i \rangle_k^n$ denotes an ordered subset of k indexes with each index in $\{1, \dots, n\}$. For example, $\langle i \rangle_2^3$ denotes the possible subsets $\{1, 2\}, \{1, 3\}, \{2, 3\}$, and ν_2 therefore considers all pairwise interactions between three particles. The dynamic Boltzmann distribution is

$$\tilde{p}(n, \alpha, \mathbf{x}, t; \{\nu\}) = \frac{1}{Z[\{\nu\}]} \exp \left[- \sum_{k=1}^K \sum_{\langle i \rangle_k^n} \nu_k(\alpha_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, \mathbf{x}_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, t) \right]. \quad (1)$$

Introduce a general functional \mathcal{F}_k to describe the time evolution of each interaction function

$$\frac{d}{dt} \nu_k(\alpha_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, \mathbf{x}_{\langle i \rangle_k^n}, t) = \mathcal{F}_k[\{\nu\}, \{F_k\}](\alpha, \mathbf{x}, t), \quad (2)$$

where \mathcal{F}_k are functionals of the interactions $\{\nu\}$ and some unspecified set of ordinary functions $\{F_k\}$. This allows e.g. a PDE to be introduced as the reduced model.

If the form of the functionals \mathcal{F}_k is chosen, a variational problem can be formulated for the functions $\{F_k\}$ appearing on the right hand side. Variational problems of this form for the functions appearing on the right hand side of a differential equation have been considered previously [2, 3, 5]. In the current framework the variational problem to extremize an action

$$S = \int_0^T dt \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}}(p||\tilde{p}) \quad (3)$$

is derived in [1] - the result is

$$\delta S = - \int_0^T dt \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \sum_{\alpha} \int d\mathbf{x} \sum_{k=1}^K \sum_{\langle i \rangle_k^n} \sum_{s=1}^{M_k} \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta F_k^{(s)}(\{\nu(\alpha, \mathbf{x}, t)\})} \delta F_k^{(s)}(\{\nu(\alpha, \mathbf{x}, t)\}) = 0, \quad (4)$$

where

$$\mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t) = \sum_{n'=0}^{\infty} \sum_{\alpha'} \int d\mathbf{x}' \zeta^\top(\alpha', \mathbf{x}', t) \mathcal{F}[\{\nu\}](\alpha', \mathbf{x}', t), \quad (5)$$

and the adjoint system is

$$\frac{d\zeta}{dt} = \Delta\boldsymbol{\mu}(\alpha, \beta, t) - \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta \nu(\alpha, \mathbf{x}, t)}. \quad (6)$$

where $\Delta\boldsymbol{\mu}$ are the differences in the moments (by convention, the average under the model distribution minus the average under the data distribution) for which ν are the Lagrange multipliers.

This is the variational calculus form of the sensitivity equation and adjoint system in Section 4.3. For further details we refer to [1].

1.2 Recover formalism for dynamic centered deep Boltzmann machines

To recover the DBM formalism of the current work, we first make the connection between k -particle interaction functions in continuous space and interaction parameters between discrete sites organized into layers. In this case, only self and pairwise interactions between neighboring layers exist, i.e. $K = 2$. Assign to every unit $s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)}$ a spatial location $x_i^{(l)}$ (including latent variables). First, consider the non-centered case $\mu_\alpha^{(l)} \rightarrow 0$, then the connection is:

$$\begin{aligned} \nu_1(\alpha, x, t) &\rightarrow - \sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} a_\alpha^{(l)}(t), \\ \nu_2(\alpha, \beta, x, y, t) &\rightarrow - \sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_j^{(l+1)}} W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l, l+1)}(t), \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

where $\delta_{x,y} = 1$ if $x = y$ and 0 otherwise is the Kronecker delta, and the negative sign accounts for the sign convention in the energy function (1). Similarly, the adjoint variables are

$$\begin{aligned} \zeta_1(\alpha, x, t) &\rightarrow \sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} \phi_\alpha^{(l)}(t), \\ \zeta_2(\alpha, \beta, x, y, t) &\rightarrow \sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_j^{(l+1)}} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l, l+1)}(t), \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

Finally the constraint equations, originally formulated in terms of a functional \mathcal{F}_k of a set of ordinary functions $\{F_k\}$, now become just an ordinary function:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{F}_1[\{\nu\}, \{F_1\}](\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t) &\rightarrow -F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}(\boldsymbol{\theta}(t); \mathbf{u}_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}), \\ \mathcal{F}_2[\{\nu\}, \{F_2\}](\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t) &\rightarrow -F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}(\boldsymbol{\theta}(t); \mathbf{u}_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}).\end{aligned}\quad (9)$$

where the negative sign results from the convention for the energy function (1) as before.

To transform to the centered frame instead, the connection is:

$$\begin{aligned}\nu_1(\alpha, x, t) &\rightarrow -\sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} \left(\tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}(t) - \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)} \right), \\ \nu_2(\alpha, \beta, x, y, t) &\rightarrow -\sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \delta_{x, x_i^{(l)}} \delta_{x, x_j^{(l+1)}} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}(t),\end{aligned}\quad (10)$$

and the constraint equations describing the time evolution of the centered parameters now are:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{F}_1[\{\nu\}, \{F_1\}](\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t) &\rightarrow -F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)} - \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \left(F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)} + \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)}}{dt} \right), \\ \mathcal{F}_2[\{\nu\}, \{F_2\}](\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t) &\rightarrow -F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)},\end{aligned}\quad (11)$$

and the adjoint variables are unchanged.

The functional \mathcal{J} in (5) becomes:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t) &\rightarrow -\sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\alpha \in \mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+1)}} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)} - \sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\alpha \in \mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \times \\ &\left(F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)} + \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \left(F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)} + \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)}}{dt} \right) \right).\end{aligned}\quad (12)$$

In the adjoint system (6), the variational derivatives become (see also Appendix 4 for this result):

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta \nu_1(\alpha, x, t)} &\rightarrow -\frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} = \psi_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}, \\ \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta \nu_2(\alpha, \beta, y, t)} &\rightarrow -\frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \\ &= \psi_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)} - q^{(l,l+1)} \left(\mu_\alpha^{(l)} \psi_{a_\beta}^{(l+1)} + \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} \psi_{a_\alpha}^{(l)} - \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \frac{d\mu_\alpha^{(l)}}{dt} - \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+1)}}{dt} \right),\end{aligned}\quad (13)$$

where ψ_θ from Section 4.3 is

$$\begin{aligned}\psi_\theta &= \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \theta} + \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ &\left(\frac{\partial F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)}}{\partial \theta} + \sum_{\Delta m=\pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)}}{\partial \theta} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} \right).\end{aligned}\quad (14)$$

which substituted into (6) recovers the adjoint system in Section 4.3

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d}{dt} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right] - \psi_{a_\alpha^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{d}{dt} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} \right] - \psi_{W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \\ &\quad + q^{(l,l+1)} \left(\mu_\alpha^{(l)} \psi_{a_\beta^{(l+1)}} + \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} \psi_{a_\alpha^{(l)}} - \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \frac{d\mu_\alpha^{(l)}}{dt} - \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+1)}}{dt} \right). \end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

The condition for extremizing the action 4 now gives the sensitivity equation - the variational derivatives become:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta F_1^{(s)}(\{\nu(\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t)\})} &\rightarrow - \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}} = \phi_\alpha^{(l)}, \\ \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta F_2^{(s)}(\{\nu(\boldsymbol{\alpha}, \mathbf{x}, t)\})} &\rightarrow - \frac{\delta \mathcal{J}[\{\nu\}, \{\zeta\}](t)}{\delta F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}} = \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \mu_\alpha^{(l)}, \end{aligned} \quad (16)$$

which substituted into (4) recovers the update equations of Section 4.3:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dS}{du_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}} &= - \int_0^T dt \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \frac{\partial F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}}{\partial u_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{dS}{du_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}} &= - \int_0^T dt \left(\Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \mu_\alpha^{(l)} \right) \frac{\partial F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}}{\partial u_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}}. \end{aligned} \quad (17)$$

2 Derivation of the centered gradient for DBMs in Section 3.3

Recall the setting of Section 3.3. The parameter transformations between regular DBM parameters $a_\alpha^{(l)}, W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}$ and centered DBM parameters $\tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}, \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}$ are:

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} \\ \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)} &= a_\alpha^{(l)} + \sum_{\Delta l = \pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)}, \end{aligned} \quad (18)$$

where it is implicit that the sum should contain a delta function of the form $(1 - \delta_{l,0} \delta_{\Delta l, -1}) \times (1 - \delta_{l,L-1} \delta_{\Delta l, +1})$ since layer indexes are restricted to $l = 0, \dots, L-1$.

After transforming the energy function to the centered parameters, taking the gradient with respect to centered parameters gives:

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[(s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} - \mu_\alpha^{(l)}) (s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} - \mu_\beta^{(l+1)}) \right], \\ \Delta \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right], \end{aligned} \quad (19)$$

where

$$\Delta \mathbb{E} [X] = \langle X \rangle^{(m)} - \langle X \rangle^{(d)} \quad (20)$$

is the *difference in expectation values*.

Parameters in the centered and regular DBMs are updated as:

$$\begin{aligned}\tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(\text{new},l,l+1)} &= \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} - \eta\Delta\tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} & \& \quad W_{\alpha\beta}^{(\text{new},l,l+1)} = W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} - \eta\Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}, \\ \tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(\text{new},l)} &= \tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(l)} - \eta\Delta\tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(l)} & \& \quad a_{\alpha}^{(\text{new},l)} = a_{\alpha}^{(l)} - \eta\Delta a_{\alpha}^{(l)}.\end{aligned}\tag{21}$$

Transforming the new centered parameters back to identify the updates for the original gives:

$$\begin{aligned}\tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(\text{new},l,l+1)} &= W_{\alpha\beta}^{(\text{new},l,l+1)}, \\ \Rightarrow \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} - \eta\Delta\tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} - \eta\Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}, \\ \Rightarrow \Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \Delta\tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)},\end{aligned}\tag{22}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}\tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(\text{new},l)} &= a_{\alpha}^{(\text{new},l)} + \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} W_{\alpha\beta}^{(\text{new},l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_{\beta}^{(l+\Delta l)}, \\ \Rightarrow \tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(l)} - \eta\Delta\tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(l)} &= a_{\alpha}^{(l)} - \eta\Delta a_{\alpha}^{(l)} + \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} (W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} - \eta\Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)}) \mu_{\beta}^{(l+\Delta l)}, \\ \Rightarrow \Delta a_{\alpha}^{(l)} &= \Delta\tilde{a}_{\alpha}^{(l)} - \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_{\beta}^{(l+\Delta l)},\end{aligned}\tag{23}$$

gives the update rules of Section 3.3:

$$\begin{aligned}\Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \Delta\mathbb{E} \left[(s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} - \mu_{\alpha}^{(l)})(s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} - \mu_{\beta}^{(l+1)}) \right], \\ \Delta a_{\alpha}^{(l)} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \Delta\mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right] - \sum_{\Delta l=\pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \Delta W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_{\beta}^{(l+\Delta l)}.\end{aligned}\tag{24}$$

3 Derivation of the moment closure approximation made by dynamic Boltzmann distributions in Section 4.2

This clarifies the chain rule used to derive the key result of Section 4.2. For any observable $\langle X \rangle^{(m)}$, we have:

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\langle X \rangle^{(m)}}{dt} &= \sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\alpha\in\mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \frac{\partial\langle X \rangle^{(m)}}{\partial a_{\alpha}^{(l)}} \frac{\partial a_{\alpha}^{(l)}}{\partial t} + \sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\alpha\in\mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+1)}} \frac{\partial\langle X \rangle^{(m)}}{\partial W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \frac{\partial W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}}{\partial t} \\ &= \sum_{l=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\alpha\in\mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \text{Cov} \left(X, s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right) F_{a_{\alpha}}^{(l)} + \sum_{l=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\alpha\in\mathcal{R}^{(l)}} \sum_{\beta\in\mathcal{R}^{(l+1)}} \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \text{Cov} \left(X, s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} \right) F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)},\end{aligned}\tag{25}$$

where $\text{Cov}(X, Y) = \langle XY \rangle^{(m)} - \langle X \rangle^{(m)} \langle Y \rangle^{(m)}$.

4 Derivation of the centered gradient for dynamic Boltzmann distributions in Section 4.3

This section derives the centered gradient [4] in the dynamic DBM formalism of Section 4.3.

4.1 Transforming the reduced model to the centered parameters

Taking a derivative in time of the parameter transformations (33) gives:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}, \\ \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)} &= F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)} + \sum_{\Delta l = \pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \left(F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)} + W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)}}{dt} \right). \end{aligned} \quad (26)$$

Note that we should not explicitly use the fact that we later substitute the centers for:

$$\mu_\alpha^{(l)} = \frac{1}{N^{(l)}} \sum_i \langle s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \rangle^{(d)}. \quad (27)$$

For now, we just consider them as arbitrary parameters.

4.2 Derivation of the adjoint system

Introduce adjoint variables $\phi_\alpha^{(l)}, \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l)}$ to $\tilde{a}_\alpha, \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}$. The Hamiltonian system is:

$$\begin{aligned} H = -\mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}} &+ \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)} + \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ &\left(F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)} + \sum_{\Delta m = \pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \left(F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} + W_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \frac{d\mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)}}{dt} \right) \right), \end{aligned} \quad (28)$$

from which the dynamical system is given by:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \frac{\partial H}{\partial \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \\ \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)} &= \frac{\partial H}{\partial \phi_\alpha^{(l)}} \end{cases} \quad \& \quad \begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= -\frac{\partial H}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \\ \frac{d}{dt} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} &= -\frac{\partial H}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} \end{cases}. \quad (29)$$

Calculating the adjoint equations gives:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d}{dt} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} &= \frac{\partial \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} - \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} - \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ &\left(\frac{\partial F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} + \sum_{\Delta m = \pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} \right), \\ \frac{d}{dt} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \frac{\partial \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} - \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} - \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ &\left(\frac{\partial F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} + \sum_{\Delta m = \pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} \right) \\ &- \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} q^{(l,l+1)} \frac{d\mu_\alpha^{(l)}}{dt} - \phi_\alpha^{(l)} q^{(l,l+1)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+1)}}{dt}. \end{aligned} \quad (30)$$

The KL-divergence evaluate to:

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right], \\ \frac{\partial \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} &= \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[(s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} - \mu_\alpha^{(l)})(s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} - \mu_\beta^{(l+1)}) \right].\end{aligned}\quad (31)$$

We can simplify the remaining derivative terms as follows: for any F :

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial F}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} &= \sum_{\theta \in \boldsymbol{\theta}} \frac{\partial F}{\partial \theta} \frac{\partial \theta}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{\partial F}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} &= \sum_{\theta \in \boldsymbol{\theta}} \frac{\partial F}{\partial \theta} \frac{\partial \theta}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}},\end{aligned}\quad (32)$$

where we leave implicit that $\partial F / \partial \theta = 0$ if $\theta \notin \boldsymbol{\theta}$, i.e. if θ is not in the domain of F .

To evaluate $\partial \theta / \partial \tilde{\theta}$: first rearrange (33) to find the reverse transformations:

$$\begin{aligned}W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}, \\ a_\alpha^{(l)} &= \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)} - \sum_{\Delta l = \pm 1} q^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \sum_{\beta \in \mathcal{R}^{(l+\Delta l)}} \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+\Delta l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+\Delta l)},\end{aligned}\quad (33)$$

and differentiate to find:

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial W_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} &= \delta_{\zeta,\alpha} \delta_{\eta,\beta} \delta_{m,l}, \\ \frac{\partial W_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} &= 0, \\ \frac{\partial a_\zeta^{(m)}}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} &= -\delta_{m,l+1} \delta_{\zeta,\beta} q^{(l,l+1)} \mu_\alpha^{(l)} - \delta_{m,l} \delta_{\zeta,\alpha} q^{(l,l+1)} \mu_\beta^{(l+1)}, \\ \frac{\partial a_\zeta^{(m)}}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} &= \delta_{\zeta,\alpha} \delta_{m,l},\end{aligned}\quad (34)$$

which after substituting into (32) gives:

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial F}{\partial \tilde{a}_\alpha^{(l)}} &= \frac{\partial F}{\partial a_\alpha^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{\partial F}{\partial \tilde{W}_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} &= \frac{\partial F}{\partial W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} - \frac{\partial F}{\partial a_\beta^{(l+1)}} q^{(l,l+1)} \mu_\alpha^{(l)} - \frac{\partial F}{\partial a_\alpha^{(l)}} q^{(l,l+1)} \mu_\beta^{(l+1)}.\end{aligned}\quad (35)$$

Returning to implement these simplifications in the adjoint system (30) gives the result of Section 4.3:

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d}{dt} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N^{(l)}} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} \right] - \psi_{a_\alpha^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{d}{dt} \Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} &= \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \Delta \mathbb{E} \left[(s_{i,\alpha}^{(l)} - \mu_\alpha^{(l)})(s_{j,\beta}^{(l+1)} - \mu_\beta^{(l+1)}) \right] \\ &\quad - \psi_{W_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)}} + q^{(l,l+1)} \left(\mu_\alpha^{(l)} \psi_{a_\beta^{(l+1)}} + \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} \psi_{a_\alpha^{(l)}} - \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \frac{d\mu_\alpha^{(l)}}{dt} - \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \frac{d\mu_\beta^{(l+1)}}{dt} \right),\end{aligned}\quad (36)$$

where we have defined for any parameter θ the following common derivative term:

$$\begin{aligned} \psi_\theta = & \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)}}{\partial \theta} + \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ & \left(\frac{\partial F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)}}{\partial \theta} + \sum_{\Delta m = \pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \frac{\partial F_{W_{\eta\zeta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)}}{\partial \theta} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} \right). \end{aligned} \quad (37)$$

4.3 Derivation of the sensitivity equation

The sensitivity (update) equations can be obtained from the Lagrangian:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{L} = & \mathcal{D}_{\text{KL}} + \sum_{m=0}^{L-2} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+1)}} \Lambda_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+1)} F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+1)} + \sum_{m=0}^{L-1} \sum_{\zeta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m)}} \phi_\zeta^{(m)} \times \\ & \left(F_{a_\zeta}^{(m)} + \sum_{\Delta m = \pm 1} q^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \sum_{\eta \in \mathcal{R}^{(m+\Delta m)}} \left(F_{W_{\zeta\eta}}^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)} + W_{\zeta\eta}^{(m,m+\Delta m)} \frac{d\mu_\eta^{(m+\Delta m)}}{dt} \right) \right), \end{aligned} \quad (38)$$

from which the objective function is given by the usual relation $S = \int_0^T dt \mathcal{L}$. By differentiating with respect to the parameter vector \mathbf{u} appearing in the differential equations F we obtain the result of Section 4.3:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dS}{d\mathbf{u}_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}} &= - \int_0^T dt \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \frac{\partial F_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}}{\partial \mathbf{u}_{a_\alpha}^{(l)}}, \\ \frac{dS}{d\mathbf{u}_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}} &= - \int_0^T dt \left(\Lambda_{\alpha\beta}^{(l,l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\alpha^{(l)} \mu_\beta^{(l+1)} + q^{(l,l+1)} \phi_\beta^{(l+1)} \mu_\alpha^{(l)} \right) \frac{\partial F_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}}{\partial \mathbf{u}_{W_{\alpha\beta}}^{(l,l+1)}}. \end{aligned} \quad (39)$$

In practice, we restrict the limits of integration to a window $[\tau, \tau + \Delta\tau]$, where we slide τ every few optimization steps to cover the full range $[0, T]$.

References

- [1] Oliver K. Ernst, Tom Bartol, Terrence Sejnowski, and Eric Mjolsness. Learning moment closure in reaction-diffusion systems with spatial dynamic Boltzmann distributions. *arXiv e-prints*, page arXiv:1808.08630, Aug 2018.
- [2] R. V. Gamkrelidze. *Principles of Optimal Control Theory*. Springer US, Boston, MA, 1978.
- [3] R. V. Gamkrelidze and G. L. Kharatishvili. Extremal problems in linear topological spaces. i. *Mathematical systems theory*, 1(3):229–256, Sep 1967.
- [4] Jan Melchior, Asja Fischer, and Laurenz Wiskott. How to center deep boltzmann machines. *The Journal of Machine Learning Research*, 17(1):3387–3447, 2016.
- [5] Lucien W. Neustadt. Optimal control problems with operator equation restrictions. In A. V. Balakrishnan, M. Contensou, B. F. de Veubeke, P. Krée, J. L. Lions, and N. N. Moiseev, editors, *Symposium on Optimization*, pages 292–306, Berlin, Heidelberg, 1970. Springer Berlin Heidelberg.